

**2020 QUILL AND SCROLL NEWS MEDIA EVALUATION**

REGISTRATION FORM and QUESTIONNAIRE

**Postmark Deadline: Friday, June 15, 2020**

Adviser: Please read and fill in the requested information.

**If you choose more than one evaluation**, please fill out a separate Registration Form for each medium.

**TYPE OF EVALUATION REQUESTED ON THIS FORM**

1. **\_\_\_\_ COMPREHENSIVE NEWS MULTIMEDIA.** Do you have a newspaper or magazine, plus a website and social media? Submit multiple media for a full evaluation of your entire news and journalism programs. These critiques include extensive comments from your evaluator. (Fee is $150.)
2. **\_\_\_\_ COMPREHENSIVE SINGLE NEWS MEDIUM.** Submit a single medium (newspaper, news magazine or online news site) for a full evaluation. These critiques include extensive comments from your evaluator. (Fee is $80 per medium.)
3. **\_\_\_\_ RATINGS ONLY NEWS MULTIMEDIA.** Submit your multimedia news operation for a ratings-only evaluation ($80). These critiques include no comments from your evaluator. (Fee is $80.)
4. **\_\_\_\_ RATINGS ONLY SINGLE NEWS MEDIUM.** Submit a single medium (newspaper, news magazine or online news site) for a ratings-only evaluation. These critiques include no comments from your evaluator. (Fee is $55.)

**CONTACT INFORMATION**

School Name Street Address

City State ZIP

Adviser’s Name Name(s) of Editors

School Phone Adviser summer email

Adviser Cell Phone Publication URL (if needed)

**PAYMENT INFORMATION**

Check the statement that applies to your payment.

1. \_\_\_\_ I ordered an evaluation when I entered the 2020 Writing, Photo and Multimedia Contest.
2. \_\_\_\_ I paid online with a credit card. (INCLUDE COPY OF RECEIPT)
3. \_\_\_\_ I am enclosing a check for $\_\_\_\_\_\_ with this form.
4. \_\_\_\_ I am enclosing a purchase order for $ \_\_\_\_\_\_ with this form.

**FROM THE QUILL AND SCROLL EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR**

Dear Friend of Quill and Scroll:

Quill and Scroll, working with the Journalism Education Association over the past two years, has devised guidelines for the proper training of critique judges and for the education of advisers in understanding the proper place for a critique in their classroom and newsroom.

Advisers should understand their role in submitting publications for critique.

**BEFORE SUBMITTING WORK FOR CRITIQUE**

* + Adviser or student leaders should formulate a statement summarizing targeted areas of growth, as well as specific questions about the current year’s work.
  + Provide information about the school, student staff and media outlet, as requested by the sponsoring organization, to give judges insight into factors affecting content and coverage.
  + Seek critiques from different organizations to form multiple perspectives.

**GENERAL DIRECTIONS**

To enter, please follow instructions carefully:

1. Download NME Registration Form from the News Media Evaluation page on our website <http://quillandscroll.org/news-media-evaluation/> and type in your answers.
2. Save the document as both a Word doc and as a PDF and email both to [quillscroll@gmail.com](mailto:quillscroll@gmail.com).
3. [Pay by credit card online or](https://paydirect.link2gov.com/quillscrollmembership/ItemSelection/SelectItems) by check payable to Quill and Scroll. mail to the address below.
4. If you have print publications that need to evaluated, email PDFs of **three separate issues to** [**quillscroll@gmail.com**](mailto:quillscroll@gmail.com)(you choose the issues) or mail the physical issues by June 15, 2020 to:

News Media Evaluation

Quill and Scroll

University of Iowa School of Journalism and Mass Comm.

100 Adler Journalism Bldg., Room W111

Iowa City, IA 52242

**AFTER RECEIVING A CRITIQUE**

* + Review and understand the feedback before sharing it widely with students. Determine which areas of a critique should be emphasized.
  + Celebrate success.
  + See criticism as an opportunity for growth and future success.
  + Synthesize feedback from a variety of critiques from multiple organizations to establish strategies for improvement and growth; apply lessons learned to a wide spectrum of future work.
  + Use evaluations as teaching tools; encourage students to use evaluation instruments for peer editing.
  + Understand that critiques are not designed to be a qualitative measure of teacher performance but may be conversation starters with school administrators.
  + Share feedback about the evaluation results and processes with contest administrators, but understand that evaluators/judges are colleagues or professionals giving their time and expertise with the best of intentions.

The Quill and Scroll Board of Directors has revamped this critique form to meet those expectations. We now have five areas for evaluation. They are:

1. General Practices
2. Coverage
3. Writing and Editing
4. Visuals
5. Digital — Social Media and Website (For Online Only and Multimedia Evaluations)

Judges will attach a ranking in each area. Those rankings are:

1. Superior
2. Excellent
3. Good
4. Needs Improvement

Here are the list of awards, in order of prestige:

* George H. Gallup Award
  + This means that a publication has received a “Superior” rating overall in each of the four or five areas for evaluation.
* International First Place Award
  + This means that a publication has received at least one “Superior” and at least one “Excellent” rating in the four or five areas for evaluation, with the other areas rated “Good.”
* International Second Place Award
  + This means that a publication has received “Good” or better in the four or five areas for evaluation, but does not qualify for the higher awards.
* International Honor Award
  + This means the publication has received at least one “Needs Improvement” rating in the four or five areas for evaluation.

In addition to providing you and your students valuable insight as to how to improve your student publications, Quill and Scroll uses this critique service to fulfill its core missions, to “encourage, support and recognize individual student initiative and achievement in scholastic journalism, irregardless the medium.” Thank you for submitting your students’ work for evaluation. If you’re not already a charter school in Quill and Scroll, we invite you to consider starting a chapter. If you are a charter member, we welcome your input in the organization, and we look forward to inducting your students into the 94-year-old tradition that is Quill and Scroll.

Sincerely,

Jeff Browne, Quill and Scroll Executive Director

[jeffrey-browne@uiowa.edu](mailto:jeffrey-browne@uiowa.edu)

319-335-3321

**GENERAL INFORMATION**

1. What type of school is this? Public? Private? Charter? Religious? Other?
2. How frequently do you publish? Weekly, bi-weekly, monthly, bi-monthly? How many publications do you try to print per year? If online only, how often do you try to update the site?
3. Audience information/Newspaper or News Magazine
   1. Total school enrollment:
   2. Total copies printed:
   3. Number of copies sold:
   4. Number of copies exchanged:
4. Audience information/Digital Publication
   1. Website page views:
   2. Average social media reach:
   3. Facebook page likes:
   4. Twitter followers:
   5. Followers of other social media platforms (provide details):
5. How many students contribute to the publication in editorial (non-business) positions?
6. How many students contribute to the publication in business positions?
7. Are students required to contribute to business operations? YES/NO
8. Business information REVENUE
   1. Advertising:
   2. School subsidy or activity fees:
   3. Circulation:
   4. Other:
   5. Total revenue:
9. Business information EXPENSES
   1. Printing:
   2. Other:
   3. Total expenses:
10. REVENUE - EXPENSES =

Choose (by **highlighting and making bold**) the statement or statements that apply to your operation. You may also choose to type a more complete answer under each area if you choose.

**CRITERION ONE: GENERAL PRACTICES**

1. What are 3-5 areas that your staff has worked on this year?
   1. Staff builds on prior successes and identifies areas of improvement for each school year.
   2. Staff follows through on recommendations from previous news media evaluations.
   3. Staff learns from mistakes and does not repeat similar errors throughout the school year.
   4. YOUR COMMENTS
2. What are special challenges that you’ve experienced this year? Please be specific to help your judge understand your situation. These challenges could include a change of printer, a scheduling change that reduced the size of the staff, prior review restrictions, technology barriers, etc.
   1. Uses resources and technologies available to staff.
   2. Demonstrates resourcefulness when faced with adversity.
   3. Advocates on behalf of student press rights.
   4. YOUR COMMENTS
3. What policies are in place to ensure student journalists follow ethical practices?
   1. Student journalists undergo ethics training and establish culture of ethical journalism throughout the school year.
   2. Policies for clarifications, corrections and retractions for all mediums/channels are in place and followed.
   3. Policies for when and how to use anonymous sources are in place and followed.
   4. Clarifications, corrections and retractions are timely and transparent.
   5. Editorial processes are in place for student editors to serve as checkpoints for ethical journalism.
   6. Potential conflicts of interest are discussed and addressed.
   7. Policies separate news content, opinion content and marketing/advertising content.
   8. YOUR COMMENTS
4. Is the journalism program a class or club? How is the staff organized? What role does the adviser play?
   1. Appropriate policies are maintained to address media leadership, staff organization and responsibilities, as well as procedures to recruit, select and train editors, reporters and other staff members.
   2. Staff and adviser responsibilities and authority are outlined in the staff manual, and include the process for selecting the editor-in-chief as well as the production deadlines and timelines.
   3. Advisers coach the staff members, but do not do the work for them.
   4. Follow a policy in which the media leadership and news coverage are under the general supervision of the editor-in-chief, and the specific supervision of associate editors, and/or other line editors. Media staff leadership may operate under other titles such as managers, producers or directors. Staff perform all news dissemination tasks.
   5. YOUR COMMENTS
5. How do you assemble and support an inclusive staff that is representative of the school population in gender, ethnic, racial, religious, ability, sexual orientation and other diverse characteristics? **(OPEN QUESTION)**

**CRITERION TWO: COVERAGE**

1. How comprehensive is your coverage, including classes, sports, extra-curricular activities, student life and community/world news? Coverage includes stories that cover:
   1. **Student experiences**: classes, sports, extra-curricular activities, student life and community/world news, services available to students, including health, guidance counseling, parking, and building maintenance
   2. **Faculty & Administrators:** including employment, development, training, policies addressing district matters such as school safety, calendars, budgets, schedules and attendance.
   3. **District, state, and national institutions**: school boards and purchases, building repairs and construction, school board elections, calendars, taxes and budgets and their impact.
   4. YOUR COMMENTS
2. Do stories include diverse student voices and viewpoints?
   1. Stories include appropriate perspectives from all types of students.
   2. Stories include appropriate perspectives from all types of faculty, administrators, parents and/or community members.
   3. YOUR COMMENTS
3. Is there a range of stories, such as hard news, investigative, features, profiles and trend stories?
   1. Topics reflect the interests of diverse readers
   2. Staff uses relevant and credible sources to explore trends, issues and society.
   3. Staff chooses a variety of story forms as appropriate, including hard news, investigative, features, and profiles.
   4. Staff varies its use of alternative story forms, including briefs, features, sidebars and visuals.
   5. Staff seizes opportunities to investigate and thoroughly report news; uses Internet and
   6. other secondary sources primarily as background
   7. Staff utilizes media platforms to fully engage audiences in stories covered
   8. YOUR COMMENTS

**CRITERION THREE: WRITING AND EDITING**

1. How did you ensure stories are factually accurate, concise, clear and fair?
2. How well does your work adhere to the other hallmarks of strong journalistic writing and editing?
   1. Stories are factually accurate.
   2. Stories are thoroughly reported and supported by facts, anecdotes and/or research.
   3. Stories include more than one source and provide multiple perspectives.
   4. Writing is clear, concise and compelling.
   5. Writer has an engaging voice.
   6. Complex processes and technical information are clearly explained.
   7. Stories are well organized with strong nut grafs, interesting ledes and good flow.
   8. Strong quotes add meaning, emotion and voice to stories.
   9. Stories have been edited and do not contain errors in spelling, grammar and punctuation.
   10. Processes are in place for editing and fact-checking.
   11. YOUR COMMENTS
3. Anything else we should know about your approach to reporting, writing and editing? **(OPEN QUESTION)**

**CRITERION FOUR: VISUALS**

1. Describe the process to create the design for your publication.
   1. Use spot color/colored pages to highlight particular stories or headlines, based on a design style, while ensuring readability.
   2. Use special effects, such as text wraps, close ups, cut-outs, bleeds or dropped capital letters, to vary presentations. Use display headlines and color for special effect; and, when possible, use secondary heads to attract readers.
   3. Use updated layout, editing and design software, such as InDesign, WordPress, Final Cut Pro, Audacity to achieve creative, professional results.
   4. Include visually interesting indexes or teasers to preview key stories
   5. YOUR COMMENTS
2. How are photography and graphics used to enhance storytelling and design?
   1. Photo/video subjects are in action, rather than posed.
   2. Photo/video illustrations, dramatizations and manipulations are clearly labeled and care is taken when using computer alterations to retain proportions and original content.
   3. Students on staff assign, take and edit all photos/videos and use various techniques, such as leading lines and framing (rule of thirds), to draw the reader’s attention.
   4. Photographers/videographers talk to reporters, producers and editors about stories prior to shooting assignments.
   5. Staff is mindful of legal and ethical issues pertaining to photos/videos, including manipulation, copyright, and labeling stipulations.
   6. YOUR COMMENTS

**CRITERION FIVE (For Online Publication and for Comprehensive Multimedia Evaluations): DIGITAL — SOCIAL MEDIA, WEBSITE, ETC.**

1. Describe your digital platforms and how you use them, such as a website, Twitter, Facebook, Instagram, etc. Please describe any challenges or barriers your digital publications face.
   1. Recognize the full range of audio and visual production techniques available to tell stories in multimedia platforms, and make informed decisions in their storytelling applications.
   2. Ensure lighting, sound and technical effects accentuate video and/or audio performances.
   3. Use online formats and social media to provide timely and live coverage of events (sports, news, opinion, etc) as deemed appropriate for audiences.
   4. As a staff, publications experiment with new social tools as they become available and pivot to include new tools into daily workflow depending on audience engagement with the content.
   5. YOUR COMMENTS
2. How well do digital and print content supplement rather than repeat each other?
   1. Incorporate audio and sound effects to advance storytelling in photo slideshows, podcasts and video productions.
   2. New/more information is made available to readers on digital platforms.
   3. Staff utilizes the ability to hyperlink online to link to sources and spaces where audiences can find more information on a given topic.
   4. YOUR COMMENTS
3. Are there opportunities online for readers to engage with staff?
   1. Uses social media to create and engage in conversations with audience, not just as a distribution channel for content.
   2. Digital presence expands beyond just the publication’s brand. Staff members are active on social media and engage with the audiences in their roles as reporters, editors, photographers, etc.
   3. YOUR COMMENTS